

EVALUATION REPORT

State Training and Resource Centre West Bengal and Sikkim

Submitted by

Roshni Subhash and Pankaj Sarma

Content

List of Abbreviations

Executive summary

1. Background

1.1 State Training and Resource Centre Evaluation

1.1.1 Purpose

1.1.2 Objectives

1.2 Evaluation Methodology

2. Three Day Evaluation Schedule

3. Key Findings

3.1 STRC Fact Sheet

3.2 Programme Delivery

3.2.1 Identification and Capacity Building of Faculty

3.2.2 Trainings by STRC

3.2.3 Academic Committee and Programme Planning

3.2.4 Documentation and Reporting

3.2.5 Conclusions

3.3 Organizational Capacity

3.3.1 Recruitment and induction

3.3.2 Record keeping and Procedures

3.3.3 Staff meetings

3.3.4 Governance and Leadership

3.3.5 Conclusions

4. Annexures

4.1 Annexure 1- Discussions with training participants

4.2 Annexure 2 – Discussions with TSU and WBSACS

List of Abbreviations

FSW	Female Sex Workers
CINI	Child in Need Institute
DMSC	Durbar Mahila Samanway Samiti
IDUs	Injecting Drug Users
MSM	Men having Sex with Men
ORW	Out Reach Worker
PE	Peer Educator
PM	Programme Manager
SOE	Statement of Expenditure
TI	Targeted Intervention
TSU	Technical Support Unit
TNA	Training Needs assessment
FSW	Female Sex Workers
IDUs	Injecting Drug Users
MSM	Men having Sex with Men
ORW	Out Reach Worker
PE	Peer Educator
PM	Programme Manager
SOE	Statement of Expenditure
TI	Targeted Intervention
TNA	Training Needs assessment

Executive summary

The Evaluation report contains observations and evaluators comments on process, quality and quantity with regard to the performance Of the STRC on various indicators put down by NACO. The 3 Components examined here have been, Programme Delivery Organizational Capacity and Finance.

The STRC for West Bengal and Sikkim¹ is hosted by Child in Need Institute (CINI) (Kolkatta). The STRC functions on a consortium of CINI and DMSC. CINI has been working in Kolkatta since 1975 and works on various concerns of children women and adolescent health. DMSC has been a pioneer in mobilization of sex workers towards demanding their rights.

Under the consortium arrangement the STRC has delivered training programmes to both West Bengal and Sikkim in coordination with the respective SACs and TSU. The team has worked hard on the achievement of various deliverables. The STRC has made attempts at conducting TNAs, Impact Assessments, formulating operational research proposals developing training manuals, decentralizing peer trainings and rolling out the trainings. Quality and success in these endeavours vary , however it is an appreciable effort that could be strengthened in time to come.

Trainings have been rolled out to various cadres in accordance to NACO and SACs requests. A deficit however is visible in the training of peer educators in accordance to the plan of decentralization. However interactions with the resource persons, training participants TSU and SACs reveal that there is discontent regarding the quality of trainings and selection of resource persons.

Organizationally the support of CINI is enjoyed by the STRC team. CINI's team contributes with their expertise in conducting trainings and also supporting the logistics efforts. The CINI systems with regard to finance and human resource management are followed. However the in depth involvement of DMSC is not very evident. There is apparent strain over the time allocation of the

¹ The STRC was initially envisaged to serve West Bengal Sikkim and Andaman and Nicobar Islands. It was shared that owing to the non functioning of TIs in the A&N post Tsunami the STRC was expected to cater only to WB and Sikkim.

DMSC Training Officer towards the STRC and also the larger involvement and contribution of DMSC.SACS and STRC are of the opinion that the consortium arrangement needs to be reviewed.

Financial systems and Human Resource Policies by the STRC are as per the CINI norms. The systems are sound and standardized for all personnel working with CINI. The financial support provided by CINI in the event of delayed second installment has enabled the smooth functioning of the training programmes.

Background

1.1 State Training and Resource Centre Evaluation

National AIDS Control Programme Phase III (NACP III) is focused on saturating the coverage of core and bridge population through targeted intervention (TI) programme. To standardize systems and procedures, operational guidelines have been developed for all categories of Targeted Intervention proposals namely, Men having Sex with Men (MSM), Female Sex Workers (FSW), Injecting Drug Users (IDU), Migrants and Truckers.

In order to ensure standardised and quality trainings to different categories of staff working with NGOs/CBOs on TI's with a mandate to develop a sustainable and institutionalised centre for the capacity building of partner organizations for TI's, gather learning through additional research and develop pedagogy of learning for TI scale up, National AIDS Control Organization has decided to institutionalize the training and capacity building process with the State Training and Resource Centres (STRC).

1.1.1 **Purpose:** The following exercise is being undertaken to evaluate the performance and quality of State Training and Resource Centre (STRC) CINI Kolkatta (West Bengal and Sikkim).

1.1.2 **Objectives:** To conduct a year end evaluation of STRC CINI Kolkatta (West Bengal and Sikkim).

1.2 Evaluation Methodology

Evaluation consultants, Ms Roshni Subhash and Mr Pankaj Sarma spent three days with STRC WB and Sikkim in CINI and undertook a review of the work done on various deliverables and indicators developed. To achieve this, documents and reports were reviewed, discussions and interviews with staff and faculty and NGOs trained by the STRC were also held.

2. Three Day Evaluation Schedule

Evaluator 1

Day 1 -----14th Dec 09

- Introductory meeting with STRC Team.
- Presentation by the STRC – Overview of Bandhan and STRC.
- Scheduling for the upcoming days.
- First phase of documents review.

Day 2- 15th Dec 09

- Review of training reports and other documents pertaining to Programme Delivery.
- Reviewing of documents and discussions regarding Organizational Capacity.
- Focused Group Discussions with TI team members trained by the STRC.
- Meeting with TSU.

Day 3 – 16th Dec 09

- Meeting with JD TI, WBSACS.
- Concluding discussions on Organizational Capacity and Programme delivery.

Evaluator 2

Day 1 -14th Dec 09

- Introductory meeting with STRC Team briefing on the objective and method of evaluation .
- Financial Review.

Day 2- 15th Dec 09

- Financial Review .
- Meeting with TSU.

Day 3 – 16th Dec 09

- Documentation review and de briefing .
- Meeting with PD and JD TI, WBSACS.

Key Findings

3.1 STRC Fact Sheet

1. Basic Details

A.	Name of the STRC	STRC- West Bengal and Sikkim
B.	Name of the Implementing Partner	Child in Need institute (CINI) and Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC)
C.	States/ UTs Covered	West Bengal and Sikkim
D.	Number of Districts covered	19 W.B +4 Sikkim = 23 Districts
E.	Date of Contract with NACO	1 st Jan 09
F.	Date on which started functioning	1 st Jan 09
G.	Number of TI partners covered	At initiation :- 60 W.B + 6 Sikkim = 66 TIs Currently :- 52 W.B + 5 Sikkim = 57 TIs
H.	Location of STRC:	CINI , Pailan, Kolkatta

2. Organization Structure (attached separately)

3. STRC Team

Position	Number
Training Coordinator	1
Training Officers	3
Admin And finance	1
Faculty Members	39
Total	44

4. Details of the Academic Committees formed by STRC

West Bengal Academic Committee

S.no	Name of committee members	Representation	Joining
1	Ms Kiran Misra	WB SACS	07/04/09
2	S.K Guha	Academician	07/04/09
3	Ms Bharat Dey	Community Representative	07/04/09
4	Dr Nupur Basu	Trainer	07/04/09
5	Srabani Majumdar	NGO Representative	07/04/09
6	Mr Anis Roy Choudhary	TI Representative	07/04/09
7	Dr Rumelli Das	Convenor	07/04/09

Sikkim Academic Committee

S.no	Name of committee members	Representation	Joining
1	Dr Namgyal T Sherpa	PD Sikkim SACs	15/06/09
2	Dr Sarita Lama	Sikkim Sacs (STI)	15/06/09
3	Dr D.S Kerongi , M&E	SSACS	15/06/09
4	Mr. K.P Sharma , AD Ti	SSACS	15/06/09
5	Mr. N. T. Bhutia	SSACS	15/06/09
6	Mr. Rajkumar	SSACS	15/06/09
7	Ms Marissa Dunne	TSU	15/06/09
8	Ms Chung Chungla Bhutia	SSACS	15/06/09

3.2 PROGRAMME DELIVERY

3.2.1 Identification and Capacity Building of Faculty

3.2.1.1 Identification of Faculty Members

Primary List/Directory: CINI and DMSC have organizational history of working in HIV and specifically TIs. The selection of faculty was based on this experience as well as the guidance and recommendations given by the TSU and the respective SACS. 39 names are present on this list.

The team elaborated during discussions the above mentioned process also guided the STRC on allocation of topics to the faculty.

Community Consultants: The STRC also has engaged in a process of training and utilizing Community Consultant. Initially these consultants were identified primarily for facilitation of the field visits of the training participants (part of the larger scheme of developing learning sites).

“Following are some of the criteria for selecting the consultant:

- Available for the programme at all time
- Committed to the goals and objectives of the programme
- Representative of the community and has a community acceptance
- knowledge about the local context and setting
- Knowledge about HIV/AIDS prevention programme
- Sensitive to the values of the community
- Tolerant and respectful to other' ideas and behaviors
- Have good listening, communication and inter personal; skill
- Demonstrates self confidence and shows potential for leadership
- Potential to be a strong role model of the behavior he seeks to promote with others
- Willing to learn and experiment in the field
- Having at least two years of working experience”

Ref – Criteria for KP Consultant – WB and Sikkim STRC (As submitted to the evaluators)

Process of empanelment or selection

There has been no formal process of empanelment. The STRC was able to recommend people on the basis of its previous experience on the issues at hand and discussions with TSUs and SACs were undertaken to expand the pool.

Coverage of topics-

The STRC training plan covers a range of topics from vision building of Community Based Organizations to Outreach Planning and STI Management. The list of resource persons is broadly segregated under the following heads, with indications of specialization against each person

- HIV/AIDs, Care and Support
- Legal and ethical issues
- Condom Social marketing
- Counseling
- Communication
- Management Skills and Leadership
- Documentation
- Substance Abuse
- CBO orientation
- Financial Management

The major topics (stated above) and the subdivisions therein are fairly comprehensive

3.2.1.2 Training of Faculty Members

Many of the resource pool or faculty have intensive experience in their own fields of expertise but require more inputs on HRGs and TIs. This has come through both during interactions with faculty members, training participants, TSU and SACs. However no training/orientation has been conducted for the faculty members to bridge this gap. The community consultants have received training on leadership and participatory training methodology.

3.2.1.3 Capacity of Faculty Members

Discussions with Faculty

Ms Atashi Gupta

Ms Atashi Gupta is working with CINI's adolescent health programme. Atashi has been involved with various skills building efforts, most of which are in relation to adolescent health. She shared that she has very limited experience on capacity building efforts in relation to the TIs.

Atashi has been involved in training of two batches of counselors (Old and new) with the STRC and as an orientation to the participants she received information of the duration of association with TI and their experience. She did not share of any other specific support received by her in relation to building her capacity for TI specific counseling.

As suggestions for the STRC Atashi shared that she felt in counselor specific trainings there was a lot of focus on knowledge building, whereas the skill set needs more attention.

Mr. Sujoy Roy

Is currently based at the CINI Chetna Resource Centre and has been with CINI for over 10 years. He has been involved with the leadership trainings rolled out by the STRC. Mr. Sujoy too has intensive experience in the field of adolescent health. His association with TIs has been limited. There were no instances stated where the STRC had built his capacity on the same. Mr. Sujoy also recommended that a quarterly or six monthly meeting of the core faculty was important to update them on the changes in the programme and also to orient them further on the TI context this would also help them in contextualizing their sessions.

He was appreciative of STRC dedication and efforts towards organizing quality trainings; however he recommended that trainings should allocate more time for topics to be absorbed by the participants. He felt that the topics were tightly packed together and it was difficult to do justice to each concern at hand.

Observations

Both faculty interviewed were members of CINI and had considerable experience in adolescent health and other reproductive health programmes. This variety in experience could prove to be an asset for the participants provided there is an orientation or a degree of experience with TIs or HRGs. It is evident that the STRC has not made concrete efforts towards the end. Combining this with the review of CVs of faculty, interactions with the trainees, TSU and SACs it is evident that the STRC needs to put in more consolidated efforts into selection and training of the resource persons.

3.2.2 Trainings by STRC

3.2.2.1 Identification of agencies/individuals to train peer educators

Peer educator training has been a major point of concern for the STRC. During the first phase or transition of trainings from TSU to STRC CINI peers were trained on the use of peer cards. This however was the transition phase and the training was conducted along with the TSU on a very specific tool.

The STRC team shared that the training for ORWs on Outreach planning held in April 09 was to serve the purpose of a TOT so that the ORWs could further train peer educators on the outreach tool and planning. Review of the process documentation of the training reveals that a session on planning trainings at the district level was held; however there could be more focus on the ORWs as *trainers* for peer educators of which dissemination of information would be a part. This component was found to be lacking in the exercise.

Further from the Training held in April 09, STRC team members have helped ORWs facilitate trainings for 7 TIs PEs. The numbers requiring training are many more and focused attempts need to be made in this direction.

The final decentralizing plan for Peer educator trainings includes a region wise and HRG wise division of the TIs along with names of the resource persons, some of whom are ORWs and Community Consultants.

3.2.2.2 Number of trainings conducted

The training load achievement as prepared by STRC is as follows. This does not included the planned trainings that could not be conducted be conducted.

Training Name	Training Load on STRC	Category of Staff	Month	Batches	Expected Turn up	Actual Turn-up	Achievement against load
MIS Peer card	300	PEER (281)	January & February	10	300	281	281
		ORW (48)					
		PC (2)					
		Counselor (4)					
Skills Training for counselors	30	Counselors		1	30	25	25

CBO-Guideline Visioning, Orientation and Leadership	30	PM Shadow Leader Secretary/Director	March	1	30	15	15
---	----	-------------------------------------	-------	---	----	----	----

Phase II							
Outreach Planning for ORW's(new TI)			April				
bridge	21	ORW		1	21	16	16
Core	14	ORW		1	14	14	14

TOT on Community Mobilization	30	Selected Trainers from both the states	May	1	30	30	30
-------------------------------	----	--	-----	---	----	----	----

Onsite Training for PE	45	Peer Educator	June	5 sites covering	37	37	37
------------------------	----	---------------	------	------------------	----	----	----

of new core TI(on outreach planning)				PE of each site in their respective site					
PM's Training on Programme Management	73	PM 11		1	30	13	13		
		Counselor 2							
PM's Training on Programme Management	60	PM	July	1	19	17	30		
Training of Allopaths on STI/RTI mgmt	146	Allopath		S.B- 5 NB- 2	146	38	38		
	30	PM			30	27	27		
PM's Training on Programme Management	43	PM	August	1	33	31	61		
Training of Allopaths on STI/RTI mgmt	108	Allopath		1	25	4	42		
	8	PM		8			8	8	
Training of non-allopath on STI/RTI mgmt	99	Non-Allopath		N.B-1 S.B-3	99	37	37		
CMIS	76	Accountant		1	25	16	16		

	13	M&E			9	7	7
Report for Proposal Writing	20	at Secretary level	September	1	22	24	24
CMIS	60	Accountant		1	27	19	35
	6	M&E			5	5	12
		ORW-3					
		Counsellor-1					
CMIS	41	Accountant-17	October	1	23	17	52
	1	M&E-0			12		
		Counsellor-2					
		PM-3					
Onsite Training of Peer Educator	8	Peer Educator		1	8	8	8
Harm Reduction(WB)	15-ORW	ORW		1	15	8	8
	5-PM	PM			5	3	3
TRAINING OF Community Consultant	16	Community Consultant		1	16	16	16
Harm Reduction(NB)	15-ORW	ORW		1	15	18	18
	7-PM	PM			7	7	7
Training of Allopaths on	93	Allopath	2-NB	34	15	57	

STI/RTI mgmt(NB)							
Training of Allopaths on STI/RTI mgmt(SB)	36	Allopath	November	2-SB	19	14	71
Training of non-allopath on STI/RTI mgmt (NB)	47	Non-Allopaths		1-NB	27	3	40
Training of non-allopath on STI/RTI mgmt (SB)	44	Non-Allopaths		2-SB	45	1	41
Counselors Training on Counseling Skills	103	Counselors		1	31-old	24	46
				1	25-new	22	

The trainings that were planned but could not be conducted were

- Condom Social Marketing
- Counselors skill training
- Micro Planning Outreach planning
- Peer educators onsite training (partially completed)

3.2.2.3 Field Visits for the training participants

Field visits were undertaken for most of the trainings organized by the STRC. The sites have been identified for exposure to interventions on FSW (brothel based and flying sex workers), IDU, CBO and MSM. These sites were finalized based on the findings of the TI Evaluation reports and discussions with SACS.

3.2.2.4 Training needs Assessment/Capacity assessment of NGO partners

For the existing targeted interventions discussions with Sacs, TSU and TI evaluations have served towards developing and understanding of the capacities of the teams. However for the newly identified TIs an exercise was carried out to assess the training requirements. This exercise was carried out with 6 new TI and questionnaires and discussions were the tools used for the same. Group discussions were the primary tools used for the peer cadre. The results as captured by the STRC in the TNS report is given below

TNA findings for New TIs

S.No	TI Staff Designation	Trainings Programs required
1	Programme Manager	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Programme management• Proposal Writing• M & E• CMIS• Induction Training• Refresher Training
2	Counselor	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Counseling techniques & Strategies• Report writing and Formats• Induction Training
3	Outreach Worker	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Outreach Planning• Report writing and Formats• Induction Training
4	Peer Educator	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• STI & HIV Information• TI Information• Referral and linkage

Ref: - TNA Report prepared by the STRC

3.2.2.5 Pre and Post training evaluations

Pre and Post training evaluations were conducted for most of the trainings. Participants were expected to fill out a structured questionnaire at the beginning and end of the training. A review of the questionnaires reveals that a mixture of both HIV and TI knowledge based questions as well as cadre and training specific questions were administered.

3.2.2.6 Documentation of training including best practices.

The trainings have been documented in the format required for reporting to NACO and a more detailed report has been maintained. Details of the sessions are documented; however there has been no concentrated effort on documenting best practices in the training. The team could also consider documenting participant responses and concerns.

3.2.2.7 Translation of Training Modules.²

There were no focused attempts on translation of the training modules or materials (English to Bengali)

I - However some Bengali handouts are available for review. The topics of the same are

- Basics of communication
- STI and RTIs
- Condoms

II - A table card for programme managers has been developed on the basic components of TI, NACP III. (English)

III - A jigsaw puzzle to initiate discussions on roles of various TI cadres have been developed.

² The accuracy and quality of translation could not be reviewed as the evaluator does not know the local language.

Module development

The STRC has developed a training module for Entry Level Communication Strategy for TIs implementing Migrant Labor Projects. This module was developed at the behest of NACO and no further progress in terms of roll out has been made.

3.2.2.8 Post Training field Visits

Post training field visits were undertaken by the team to 5 of the TIs trained. These visits were primarily focused on understanding the percolation of learning acquired by PMs at the training on programme management. Group discussions were held with the TI teams to understand various aspects of the same. The findings were examined on 9 parameters the knowledge of the PM to the related knowledge of the other cadres. The scores of the 5 TIs visited ranged from 65% to 80%.

3.2.3 ACADEMIC COMMITTEE AND PROGRAMME PLANNING

3.2.3.1 Constitution of Academic Committee

The STRC has formed two separate Academic Committees for West Bengal and Sikkim. The Academic Committee for west Bengal fulfills the criteria laid down by the TOR however the Sikkim Academic Committee draws maximum representation from the Sikkim SACs. During the evaluation teams meeting with the TSU, the need for the inclusion of the TSU in the Academic Committee to ensure smoother coordination and a more realistic assessment of impact and need was shared.

3.2.3.2 Development of the work plan, monitoring indicators and the Budget

The work plan was submitted by the end of March 09. The Academic Committee minutes depict discussions on the work plan and prioritization of trainings but so far there have been no detailed discussions on the budget (apart from the funds constraint expressed by Sikkim SACS).

3.2.3.3 Identify categories of personnel to be trained during the year

The trainings plans reveal a plan for coverage of most cadres of TIs. The minutes of the Academic Committee meetings do reflect suggestions made by the committee on the need to prioritize certain trainings for specific cadres and suggestions were also made on methodology and content for the same.

The rationale behind priority given to some training as over the others is not clearly outlined in any other documentation effort apart from the Academic Committee minutes. However the STRC was able to clearly articulate the change in priorities with time and the reasons behind the shift.

3.2.3.4 Identify Best Practice sites / Learning sites for field visits

A process note has been prepared by the STRC on the selection on learning sites. The note outlines the process undertaken as well as the criteria adopted for selection of the learning site.

Some criteria were laid down along with discussions with the Academic Committee members as well as the suggestion from Joint Director- TI of West Bengal State AIDS Prevention and Control Society to identify learning sites. The evaluation reports of the organizations, for the year 2008-09, were also reviewed as part of the process of selection.

Review of the criteria

The criteria for identification of learning sites for FSW MSM IDU covered aspects such as profile of the population, client load, condom access, HRGs attending clinic, HRGS as staff of the TI, Vision of community leaders.

The criteria is fairly exhaustive but neither the process note, the criteria or the classification of learning site takes into account specific learning objectives of the groups that visit them. Identifying broad learning objectives and then setting down criteria could have been undertaken. This would be beneficial as the groups are aware of typologies and probably exposed to some if not most of them but learning objective for each cadre/training is different and it would be beneficial to understand whether the site can cater to the specific objectives. Discussions with the team did reveal that in practice however this was taken into account.

The sites identified

FSWs

- DMSC (SHIP)
- CINI- (Budge Budge)
- Hriday (North Bengal)
- DMSC (Sonagachi)

MSM:

- Manas Bangla (Kolkata)

IDU:

- SCIR (Kolkata)
- IRCS (Kurseong)

3.2.3.4 Quarterly meeting of the Academic committee

The Academic Committee for Sikkim has met once in the month of June 09. The committee discussed issues regarding inclusion of members from the academic circle to the committee, selection and responsibilities of the core faculty and the possibility of organizing combines trainings for Sikkim and North Bengal. The STRC team shared that organizing combined trainings was a necessity as only 6 TIs were operational in Sikkim and the Sikkim SACS had stated inadequate budget allocation. The option of combining trainings with North Bengal was discussed and has been implemented since.

The Academic Committee for West Bengal has met twice over the past year. During the first meeting discussions took place on the need decentralized peer educator's trainings. The committee also reviewed the AAP and made specific suggestions for some of the trainings, the website plans and selection of core faculty members.

In its second meeting the Academic Committee undertook a review of the trainings conducted by the STRC and their observations on the same have been positive. The committee also discussed priority areas for the upcoming quarter.

3.2.4 DOCUMENTATION AND REPORTING

3.2.4.1 Documentation Centre –

The STRC does not have an independent documentation center. However CINI has a fairly large and comprehensive library and also is a Regional Resource Centre. The team shared that the resources generated by the STRC were included in these and the resources available with these were used extensively by the STRC and in some cases the Kolkatta TI partners. The resources in the main library cover a range of topics including health, HIV, Child development, Adolescent health, etc.

3.2.4.2 Website

<http://www.strcwbsikkim.org/>

The STRC maintains a website which was constructed with the help of its IT department and is regularly updated and maintained by the STRC team. It contains training reports, work plans, briefs on the academic committee meetings etc. The website gives a comprehensive view of the STRC and is currently updated. The team shared that they update the website once a month.

3.2.4.3 Quarterly Newsletters

No newsletters have been printed.

3.2.4.4 Timely Submission of reports

The monthly submissions of reports have largely been between the 3rd to 5th of the month. A few exceptions were made, but overall submission was timely.

.

3.3 Organizational Capacity

3.3.1 Recruitment and induction

Office Setup

The STRC office is housed within the library of CINI. The office has been operational since the signing of the contract.

Recruitment of Staff

Current Team

S.no	Name	Role
1	Dr Rumeli Das	Assistant Director CINI and Technical Advisor STRC
2	Ms Soumi Haldar	Programme Officer CINI, Training Coordinator STRC
3	Mr. Arunava Roychoudhary	Accounts and Admin, STRC

Ms Rumelli, Ms Soumi and Mr. Arunava have been with CINI prior to STRC and have been working for the STRC since Jan 09.

S.no	Name	Role
4	Ms Sasmita Ghosh	Training Officer STRC

Ms Sasmita Ghosh had been recruited specifically for the STRC and has been with the project since Jan 09. She is based at Siliguri.

S.no	Name	Role
5	Ms Soumita Paul	Training Officer STRC

Ms Soumita was recruited on the 6th of October 09

S.no	Name	Role
6	Ms Tanushree Dutta	Training Officer STRC

She is the TO appointed by DMSC and is the most recent addition to the team. She joined the STRC on the 4th of December 09.

Team members who have discontinued

- 1- Ms Nipuna Sen was with the STRC as Training officer since Jan 09 and was with the team till September 09.
- 2- Mr. Raghunath Manna was with the STRC as training Officer from the DMSC from Jan 09 to Nov 09.

All positions were filled within the first month of the initiation of the STRC.

Induction of project staff

The project staff was given an overview of the job responsibilities at the time of the interview. Additionally CINI conducts an orientation workshop for all new recruits every quarter and the new joiners are inducted formally. Ms Soumita Paul is yet to attend this workshop as it is yet to be scheduled. She however has received informal orientations regarding the STRC and CINI as well as her responsibilities.

Staff Turnover / Attrition

Two training officers have left the STRC since Jan 09, their vacancies were filled immediately.

Staff's understanding of Job

The Project staff possesses a clear understanding of their responsibilities. Of the two new team members one has not been given a JD though her responsibilities were spelt out to her.

Dr Das provides technical support and guidance to the STRC team and also lends aid in the training workshops organized by the STRC. She has been with CINI for over a decade and also holds responsibility of the larger HIV initiatives of CINI.

Ms Soumi, Training Coordinator too has been associated with the STRC for over 5 years and is currently coordinating the STRC. Her role involves coordination with SACs and the TSU for WB

and Sikkim. She is overall responsible for the functioning of the STRC and is actively involved in the training and facilitation of the programmes of the STRC.

Ms Sasmita, Training Officer is based at Silliguri and manages the trainings for North Bengal and Sikkim. Field visits and trainings for the region are her primary responsibilities and she also coordinates with the Sikkim SACs and TSU along with Ms Soumi. She is also involved in the training and facilitation in the programmes of South Bengal.

Ms Soumita, Training Officer is relatively new to the STRC and also has limited prior experience. As she grows in her understanding of both the STRC and TIs she takes on the role of documentation and reporting. She currently supports trainings but is not given responsibilities of facilitation of session currently.

Ms Tanushree, Training Officer from DMSC is very new to the STRC and is expected to spend at least 3 days a week with the STRC team at CINI and its trainings. She is still in the process of under staining her responsibilities.

3.3.2 Record keeping and Procedures

Maintenance of Staff Operational Records

Attendance, leave and movement records are all maintained in accordance to the norms of CINI and the staff is satisfied with the procedures. Ms Soumita has been recruited currently on an assignment basis as per CINI norms and other positions are filled in on a contractual basis. The leave rules and benefits are different for both categories and a position is awarded contractual status depending on the project duration and performance of the individual.

Staff Meetings

Staff meeting minute indicate that the meetings are held regularly, though there is flexibility the date for the monthly meetings. The minutes also show that the various discussions pertaining to trainings and coordination with the different state SACs were discussed.

Governance and Leadership

Interactions and discussions with both the STRC staff revealed satisfaction with regard to the support extended towards the STRC by CINI. However the same was not evident when it came to the DMSC partnership. Decision making on recruitment of TO, time allocation for STRC etc all seems to be areas of struggle and repeated negotiations. Ms Tanushree was too new to comment on the same and attempts to contact PD Bharati Dey were not successful. These observations are based only on the discussions with one consortium partner (CINI) and STRC staff.

3.3.4 Conclusions

CINI has a long history on concerns related to child adolescent and maternal health. They see the inclusion of HIV into their ambit of work as a step towards making their interventions more wholesome. HIV as a concern figured in CINI's initiatives in the mid 90's and since has gathered scale and momentum. CINI also currently runs a SACs funded Targeted intervention.

The roles and responsibilities of the STRC paid staff are clearly spelt out and senior personnel who have had long term associations with CINI like Ms Soumi and Dr Das offer their support to other projects of CINI, No adverse effect of this is evident in their involvement with the STRC or its performance.

The organizational systems and procedures followed by the STRC adhere to the overall systems within CINI and the same is maintained systematically. The STRC staff has no visible grievance with the larger institution though there are evident strains in the consortium partnership.

The role of DMSC in the operations of the STRC is unclear even though the contract lays down the specificities. The level of involvement of the previous DMSC deputed training officer, Selection of the new appointee, DMSC's participation in the academic committee and the fulfillment of their other responsibilities (Translations, Research etc) are all areas of stress as expressed by the team. However apart from the new appointee (who was unable to comment on most areas), there were no other members available from DMSC to hold further discussions with.

3.4 Financial Evaluation

3.4.1 Contract, its validity and Budget:

Feeling the necessity, to cater the needs of West Bengal, Sikkim and Andaman & Nicobar Islands NACO selected Child in Need Institute and Durbar Sammanwaya Committee Jointly to establish an STRC at Kolkata, West Bengal. Due to non-having TI units in A&N Islands, later the proposal was limited to two states of West Bengal and Sikkim. Accordingly, a contract vide No. 15/2008-09 on 15th October 2008 was signed between CINI and DMSC as joint consultant and NACO, WBSACS and Sikkim SACS as client, to be affective from the date of joining for a period of one year or any mutually agreed date. Later the period of contract was agreed as the 2009 calendar year. In the contract the job responsibility of both the consultants were not defined. However, both the organizations shared the Job responsibilities and documented the same in a joint meeting as below:

Budget Head	Description	Total Budget	CINI	DMSC
Training Coordinator	@Rs. 20000/- pm for 1	240000/-	240000/-	-
Training officer	@Rs.15000/- pm for 3	540000/-	360000/-	180000/-
External consult	@Rs. 1000/- pd for 120d	120000/-	120000/-	-
Community consultant	@Rs.450/-per day for 18 persons for 75 days	607500/-	303750/-	303750/-
Admin. & Accounts	@Rs. 8000/- per month	96000/-	72000/-	24000/-
Resource centre	Setting up of resource centre and Website Development.	200000/-	200000/-	-
Training manual	Development. and translation of manual, VDO/CD	120000/-	-	120000/-

Operational research	Conducting research	150000/-	-	150000/-
Travel	Local & outside @10000/- per month	120000/-	96000/-	24000/-
Management	Management cost	109675/-	109675/-	-
Total		2303175/-	1501425/-	801750/-

Hence total allocation is Rs. 2303175/- plus 12.36% Service Tax raising the contract ceiling up to Rs. 2587847/-. The sharing of the two consultants are 65% and 35% based on the agreed items as shown in the above table.

3.4.2 Operation of Bank Account and availability of Fund:

The client organization CINI is having a Current Account with Axis Bank, 76/69 D.H Road, Behala Chow Rasta, Kolkata-700008 bearing No 034010100326803. Any two of the following three signatories are authorized for issue of cheques: 1) Prof. Kalyan Sankar Mandal, Financial Controller, 2) Dr. S.N Chaudhuri, Director and 3) Amit Kumar Dasgupta, Dy. Director (Admin.). There is no separate Bank account for STRC.

Though the contract was signed on 15th October 2008 and later the period of operation was agreed from January to December 2009, the first installment of 35% was released in August 2009. It has also been observed that, 35% should have been calculated on the contract ceiling of Rs. 2587847/- and service tax would have been deducted on the same. But the 35% calculation is made on the net amount of Rs. 2303175/- and tax has been deducted on the same. Accordingly, instead of Rs.806111/- they have received Rs. 723082/- vide DD No.409387 dt.4.8.2009. Though, it is to be shared at 65% and 35% among both the consultants, the amount has been deposited in the CINI main account. No direct fund has been transferred to DMSC; only periodical expenditure for agreed activities is reimbursed to them.

3.4.3 Staffing pattern and salary

All the sanction posts are filled in the first week of January 2009. Staff turnover is negligible (only two) and both filled in a week's time. The Director of CINI considered the Technical advisor. Status of staff position is as below:

Name	Designation	Date of joining	Monthly pay	Remarks
Soumi Gotha	T C	01.01.2009	20000/-	CINI
Sasmita Ghosh	T O	05.01.2009	15000/-	CINI
Nipuna Sen	T O	01.01.2009	15000/-	Left on 30.09.09
Sowmita Paul	T O	06.10.2009	15000/-	Against Nipuna for CINI
Raghunath Manna	T O	01.01.2009	15000/-	Left on 30.11.09
Tanushree Dutta	T O	01.12.2009	15000/-	Against Raghu for DMSC
Arunava Roy Choudhury	F&A staff	01.01.2009	6000/-	Part time for CINI
Gopal Kundu	F&A Staff	02.01.2009	2000/-	Part time for DMSC

3.4.4 Utilisation of fund: As submitted to NACO up to October, 2009

Items	Provision	Utilization	Remarks
1. Remuneration			
a) Tech. Advisor	1,20,000/-	1,00,000/-	Paid to the Director CINI for his Tech. support @ Rs. 10000/- a month
b) Trg. Co-ordinator	2,40,000/-	2,00,000/-	Full time duty
c) Training officer	5,40,000/-	4,20,000/-	Three officials. Two left but filled with no gap.
d) Accounts and admin	96,000/-	76,000/-	Two part timers
e) Community consultant	6,07,500/-	3,600/-	Not fully appointed and also appointed late.
Subtotal – 1.	1603500/-	7,99,600/	
2. Reimbursable			
a) Resource centre	2,00,000/-	1,07,484/-	Entirely at CINI
b) Devt. of Trg. Manual. VDO/CD	1,20,000/-	0	Developed something but expenditure is yet to book
c) operational research	1,50,000/-	0	Not yet started
d) Local transport	1,20,000/-	1,20,738/-	Program related travel cost could have booked in respective program
e) Maint. of STRC	1,09,675/-	51,391/-	Will have savings
Sub total – 2	6,99,675/-	2,79,613/-	
Net total	2303175/-	1079213/-	(-) 3, 56,131/- above the release of grant.
Service tax 12.36%	2,84,672/-		
Grand Total	2587847/-		

It is seen here that, while first installment was released in August 2009, the staff was recruited and the STRC functional from the month of January, 2009. Due to strong financial support from the parent organization the staff could get salary in time. Fund for the activities were released by the SACS in time on the basis of the program wise approved budget. Till November, 2009, the total reported expenditure for salary and other reimbursable comes to Rs. 13,29,238/- which is Rs. 6,06,156/- in excess of the release of fund but within limit of the budget. However, actual expenditure in local travel has exceeded the budget limit which includes the TD/DA of training officers for visiting North Bengal and Sikkim for conducting programs at different locations and post program follow up.

3.4.5 Programs Conducted: (till Nov. 2009)

Name of Program	No of batches	Type of participant	Target/ attendance	Budget	Actual Exp.
Peer card Training	10	Peer & ORW	350/335	408650/-	215448/-
Skill trg. for councillors	3	counselors	87/76	435406/-	162374/-
CBO guidelines and leadership devt.	1	Project manager	32/15	132400/-	48813/-
Outreach planning	7	ORW/Peers	87/87	314165/-	141777/-
Tot for community mobilization	1	PM, mentor, peer,councillor	32/31	113356/-	79404/-
Progm. Management for PM	3	PM	73/61	494304/-	357758/-
Trg of Doctors, PM	19	Doctors of STI/RTI, PM	460/150	617650/-	-

Fin. & CMIS	3	Accountant & M&E	89/74	224264/-	-
Proposal writing	1	PC, Mentor, Secy, Org rep	22/24	39400/-	-
Participatory method	1	Old councillor	30/24	38500/-	-
Harm reduction	2	PM,councillors	40/36	149650/-	-
Total	51		1288/877		

From the above it is seen that participant's turnover is 69%. The utilisation is also limited to 58.5% of the Budget provision. However, the actual expenditure for programs conducted after September 2009 is yet to be finalized pending finalization of the rate of conveyance after increase of the cost of POL. Another reason is for programs conducted at CINI, they do not charge for the classroom rent. However, for hiring of Laptop and LCD Projector they are spending a lot which is more than the cost of one new set. Out of the 51 programs, only two programs were exclusively for Sikkim SACS and the other combined with North Bengal. All other programs are for the West Bengal only. It has also been observed that three programs were conducted on Finance and CPFMS for the Accountants of TI NGOs and M&E persons. Analyzing the program schedule, it has come to the notice that only two hours were allotted for financial management, double the time for procurement and rest for CMIS. I believe this type of program cannot be a skill building program for the finance personnel.

The series of programs conducted under PPP model were thinly participated which is a matter of concern which may be due to short notice to participants and lack of follow up monitoring.

3.4.6 Maintenance of Financial records:

CINI is having its own finance manual. They maintain uniform computerized accounting system. A package has been developed called 'ACCURO' which means accounting with accuracy in double entry system and use for all accounting units under CINI. Once the vouchers (Cash + Journal) are entered this package can give computerized data up to Trial balance. The vouchers and computerized Cash Book and Ledger have been verified and found in order. As there is no separate Bank Account for STRC, there is no separate Bank reconciliation statement for the project. But they are maintaining combined bank reconciliation statement for the entire units.

3.4.7 Procurement of Assets and maintenance of Asset Register:

Two assets have been procured during the period of contract namely one set of computer and one digital Camera. CINI is having a Procurement manual. There is also a standing committee for procurement of various goods or services. Procurement of both the assets were verified and found in order. The Asset Register is maintained in computer. At the beginning of the financial year, they invite applications from the prospective suppliers and service providers and based on the set criteria, a committee shortlist them to prepare a vendor's list and get approved by the competent authority. During the year whenever any thing is to be procured, quotations are invited from the list and after preparing the Comparative statement of the eligible bidders the L-1 and L-2 is finalized. The same procedure is followed for procuring their procurements.

3.4.8 Submission of SOE:

Two types of SOE are prepared. One is for NACO funding for stuffing and reimbursable expenses and the other is for the expenditure related to the programs. The first installment of Grant from NACO was released on August 2009. Hence, there was no question of submission of SOE till August. The first SOE was prepared till October 2009 and was forwarded to NACO with a request to release the second installment. The expenditure recorded was more than the grant released. Waiting for further grant, they are not preparing any SOE. For expenditure on programs, instead

of monthly, they prepare program wise SOE regularly for each of the program and submit the same to SACS. However, from September onwards the SOE for programs are yet to be finalized. Due to non-charging the class room rent for programs conducted at CINI and due to low turnout of participants in some of the programs especially program on PPP model the utilization is low. However, they are getting regular advances from SACS for each of the programs based on its approved budget and all advances relating to programs are settled quickly in time. Entries of all financial transactions are found up-to-date.

Annexure 1

Group Discussions with NGO staff

Profile of the participants: 12 persons (4 Project managers 5 Counselors 2 ORWs and 1 accountant) from the TIs in Kolkatta were a part of the group discussions. Majority of the participants in the discussions had attended 1 training with the STRC. The group was a mix of new (less than a year) and old (over 1 year in some cases over 3 years) TI staff.

Highlights of the discussion are as follows

Field work and Practical Sessions: Most participants shared that fieldwork was an essential component of the trainings they attended and learning sites were visited. The participants also shared that group work and other participatory methodology was used in the training.

Needs Assessment and expectation gathering:

There was no formal process of needs assessment apart from an exercise conducted with the New TIs. The participants shared that their expectations from the trainings was sought at the beginning of the training and some of it was met by the conclusion of the programme.

Some of the common strengths and weaknesses of the trainings as shared by the participants is given below

Strengths Of the training:

- Group work
- Practical sessions
- Presentations

Weaknesses

- Choice of trainers (Preparedness for session, knowledge of topic, facilitation style, analysis in presentation , slides being read out not explained by some trainers etc)
- Certificates were not issued (for counselors training)

Pre Test and Post Test and Training Evaluations

Pre and Post tests were conducted in all the trainings attended by the participants. A feedback, oral in some cases and written in the others was used to evaluate the entire training experience, logistics, resource persons etc.

Suggestions

- Need take home resource material (hand outs)
- More context specific sessions. Some trainers couldn't relate topic to the trainee's context.
- Topics such as management, HR policy etc should be taken by subject matter specialists.
- More focus on skills training for counselors.

Note: Programme Managers and Counselors both spoke to the evaluator after the GD and made placed the following concerns.

- PM's training especially topics related to Management were handled by resource persons with no background in the same. As a result many of them were only reading out the presentation slides and could not field trainee's queries.
- Counselors felt that the time allocated to skills training of the counselors was too low there was too much focus on basics.
- Both groups recommended a review of the resource persons selected.
- Both groups also recommended that there be separate trainings for old and new staff. (The counselors training was planned for in such a nature but when the participants came in the STRC team realized that the TIs had not strictly followed directions)

Annexure 2

Interactions with TSU and SACS

The evaluators had an interaction with the Technical Support Unit (West Bengal and Sikkim) and SACS West Bengal. A brief on the same is given below

Technical Support Unit

The evaluators met TSU Team leader Mahesh Mahan and Training Officer Nilanjana

The concerns raised by them are as follows

- Coordination with the TSU: - As the TSU Officers were monitoring the programmes on field, it was imperative that the STRC coordinated their training activities with them. They stress that it would ensure that the trainings rolled out are more grounded to the everyday reality of TIs. It would help assess both training needs and impact of trainings. Currently they felt that this coordination and consultation was not to the desired level and they were seeing a gap in the training messages and the field situations.
- Academic Committee: They emphasized that the training officer of the TSU should be on board of the Academic Committee.
- Resource pool: The TSU also recommended that the STRC re look at its resource pool selection. This suggestion they reiterated was based on the feedback received as well as their observations. The resource pool needs to include more of the TI team members themselves so that local capacities are built. Along the same lines a suggestion was also given that the STRC team needn't be the primary resource persons for trainings as members of the team have limited TI experience. The team should play a more management or coordination role.
- Peer educators training is a priority area.

SACS

The evaluators met with PD SACS, Mr. S.K Sushantkumar Sen and JD TI Ms Kiran Misra

The PD and JD stated that they were largely satisfied with the performance of the STRC but the some areas needed further attention.

- **Quality of training and trainers:** It was reiterated that the trainings should not be conducted entirely by CINI or the STRC but draw expertise from various sources that were available and build new capacities where the need arises. This they felt would significantly improve the quality of the trainings.
- **DMSC:** The SACS team strongly stated that they were not clear about the role of DMSC and questioned the value addition it provided to the STRC. The staff deputed by the as training officer was erratic initially and there was no concrete input that the DMSC provided to the trainings and other activities of the STRC. They felt that CINI would benefit by functioning alone vis a vis the consortium arrangement.
- They also felt that often demands for quality could not always be fulfilled as the pressure from NACO was tremendous for certain roll outs. Is a steady and more predictable pace of events could be ensured, better quality too might follow.

Overall the SACs team felt that the STRC team was learning and growing and if certain suggestions are taken into account their performance would improve furthermore.

.